

FINAL REPORT

AAIU Synoptic Report No: 2009-017

State File No: IRL00909036

Published: 18/8/09

In accordance with the provisions of SI 205 of 1997, the Chief Inspector of Air Accidents, on 28 May 2009 appointed Mr. Frank Russell as the Investigator-in-Charge to carry out an Investigation into this Incident and prepare a Synoptic Report.

Aircraft Type and Registration:	Cessna 172S, EI-NFW
No. and Type of Engines:	1 x Textron LYC IO-360-L2A
Aircraft Serial Number:	17259861
Year of Manufacture:	2005
Date and Time (UTC):	28 May 2009 @ 14.24 hrs
Location:	Ireland West Airport, Knock (EIKN)
Type of Flight:	Private
Persons on Board:	Crew - 1 Passengers - 1
Injuries:	Crew - Nil Passengers - Nil
Nature of Damage:	None
Commander's Licence:	Private Pilot's Licence
Commander's Details:	Male, aged 52 years
Commander's Flying Experience:	360 hours, of which 170 were on type
Notification Source:	Irish Aviation Authority (IAA)
Information Source:	Air Traffic Control (ATC) Ireland West Airport, Knock

SYNOPSIS

While an Airbus 320, EI-DVF, was lined up and holding on Runway (RWY) 27, a Cessna 172 was given permission to land on the same runway by the duty Air Traffic Controller. This landing clearance meant that the Cessna aircraft over flew the stationary Airbus prior to touchdown deep on RWY 27. This was contrary to Air Traffic Control (ATC) procedures and was not a safe manoeuvre.

FINAL REPORT

1. FACTUAL INFORMATION

1.1 History of the Flight

EI-NFW was flown under Visual Flight Rules (VFR) from Carnmore Airport (EICM) Galway to Ireland West Airport (EIKN) Knock, to have some aircraft maintenance carried out in a local facility. The duration of this flight was approximately 30 minutes.

The Pilot called ATC EIKN at 14.17 hrs for Connaught Zone entry and was cleared to enter the Zone at Ballyhaunis. From there he was cleared to the airfield and told to expect RWY 27 for landing. From listening to the local Tower frequency, the Pilot was aware of EI-DVF's start-up and taxi clearance. He advised ATC that he had four miles to run at 1,200 ft, with the airfield in sight. He suggested to ATC that he could orbit to the East of the airfield for a minute, if that would be of help. ATC declined this offer and instructed EI-NFW to route directly to the airfield and to set down on the 09 end of RWY 27, adjacent to taxiway Bravo.

The Pilot acknowledged this instruction and his next call was on left base leg for RWY 27. ATC advised that he had him in sight and asked, "*can you land long, traffic backtracking*", to which the Pilot replied "*affirmative*". ATC, in turn, then advised EI-DVF of the Cessna landing long. EI-DVF did not comment on this call and ATC proceeded to issue the airway clearance for London Gatwick. While this clearance was being given and acknowledged, EI-NFW landed at 14.23 hrs towards the 09 end of RWY 27 and taxied to the cargo apron.

In his recall of the approach to RWY 27, the Pilot said that, while he recognised the runway situation was "*unusual*", he complied with ATC instructions and carried out a higher than normal final approach to ensure a safe clearance from the aircraft on the threshold of the runway. The Pilot felt that, in issuing the clearance as he did, the Controller was trying to be helpful.

The local weather conditions pertaining were: 200/13kts, Vis 10km, Ovc 700 ft, Temp 13°C, Dew Point 11°C, QNH 1029 hPa.

2. AAIU COMMENT

As a result of this Incident, the IAA advised the Controller that his Aerodrome and Approach Control Ratings were suspended, in accordance with the provisions of SI No.305 of 2008, Article 18, 1 (a). This was to facilitate a review of the Incident and to give the Controller a structured de-brief of the chain of events. The AAIU also subsequently interviewed the Controller. The Controller accepted that his clearance and terminology was less than professional and, on reflection, 'certainly unwise'. Following completion of the IAA Investigation, and the corrective action identified, the Controller's Ratings were restored.

There is no provision in ATC regulations for the multiple occupancy of a runway, save where a landing aircraft is clearing and another aircraft is lining up for take-off, with the permission of ATC. This is a routine operation at airports.

FINAL REPORT

In the subject Incident, one aircraft over flying and landing in front of another aircraft was a breach of Standard Air Traffic Procedures. The Pilot of EI-NFW thought his landing clearance was unusual but carried on and landed. The Captain of EI-DVF was made aware of the landing Cessna but made no comment to ATC. He subsequently wrote a report to his company on returning to Dublin.

Aviation Safety is not one dimensional, nor is ATC responsible for safety alone. Pilots bear an equal share of this responsibility and a healthy and professional interaction ensues between pilots and ATC. On this occasion, that neither Pilot saw fit to question the ATC clearance or express any concern was an unfortunate lapse of airmanship.

3. SAFETY RECOMMENDATIONS

This Report does not sustain any Safety Recommendations.

- END -